How Caregivers and Workers Fare in Cash and Counseling

Leslie Foster
Stacy Dale

June 26, 2005
AcademyHealth Annual Research Meeting
Boston MA

MATHEMATICA
Policy Research, Inc.
Why Study Caregivers and Workers?

- Informal Caregivers
  - Provide more care than paid sources
  - Help care recipients avoid nursing homes

- Directly Hired Workers
  - Are an important but overlooked group
Methods

- Effects on Primary Informal Caregivers
  - Identified at baseline; interviewed at 10 months
  - Compared treatment and control group caregivers

- Experiences of Directly Hired Workers
  - Identified and interviewed 9 to 10 months after baseline
  - Benchmarked against agency workers
Primary Informal Caregivers
Caregiver Characteristics: 3 States

- N = 1,000 – 1,400 (for Adults); 829 (for Children)
- Female (~80%)
- Related to Care Recipient (~90%)
- Married (50 to 60%)
- Dependent Children (20 to 30%)
- Employed (40 to 50%)
Some treatment group caregivers were paid for caregiving during followup

- 56% Arkansas
- 42% New Jersey
- 29% Florida (for Adult Care Recipients)
- 21% Florida (for Children)
Hours of Care Provided in 2 Weeks

- Adult Care Recipients
  - AR: T - 107*, C - 117
  - FL: T - 124, C - 133
  - NJ: T - 123*, C - 113

- Child Care Recipients
  - FL: T - 150, C - 155

* Significantly different from control group at .10 (*) level.
Experienced Great Emotional Strain

**Experienced Great Emotional Strain**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Adults</th>
<th></th>
<th>Children</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T</td>
<td>AR</td>
<td>FL</td>
<td>NJ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>27***</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>42**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>34</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Significantly different from control group at .10 (*), .05 (**), or .01 (*** level.*
Experienced Great Physical Strain

![Bar chart showing experienced great physical strain among adults and children in different states.](chart.png)

* *** Significantly different from control group at .10 (*), .05 (**), or .01 (***).
Experienced Great Financial Strain

**Percent**

**Adults**

- AR: T = 22***, C = 36
- FL: T = 30***, C = 39
- NJ: T = 30***, C = 39

**Children**

- FL: T = 44***, C = 56

***Significantly different from control group at .10 (*), .05 (**), or .01 (***)) level.
Very Satisfied with Overall Care

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Adults</th>
<th>Children</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Percent</strong></td>
<td><strong>61</strong>*</td>
<td><strong>42</strong>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>AR</strong></td>
<td><strong>43</strong></td>
<td><strong>22</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>FL</strong></td>
<td><strong>30</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>NJ</strong></td>
<td><strong>32</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*,**,** Significantly different from control group at .10 (*), .05 (**), or .01 (***).
Very Satisfied with Own Life

Percent Adults Children

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>T</th>
<th>C</th>
<th></th>
<th>T</th>
<th>C</th>
<th></th>
<th>T</th>
<th>C</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AR</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>FL</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>35</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NJ</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>38</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FL</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>24</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*** Significantly different from control group at .10 (*), .05 (**), or .01 (*** level.)
Conclusions

- Positive effects stemmed from several factors
  - Allowance, hours, other workers, payment

- Cash and Counseling could postpone burnout
  - Reduction in Arkansas nursing home use
Directly Hired Workers
Relationship of Consumer to Directly Hired Worker

Percent

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>AR Adults</th>
<th>FL Adults</th>
<th>NJ Adults</th>
<th>FL Children</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Related</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knew Previously</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did Not Know Previously</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Related: green bar
Knew Previously: purple bar
Did Not Know Previously: yellow bar
Hours of Care Provided by Directly Hired Workers

- **Paid Hours per Week**
  - 12 (Arkansas) to 20 (Florida, New Jersey)

- **Unpaid Hours per Week**
  - 59 to 74% provided some unpaid hours
  - 25% provided more than 41 unpaid hours
## Working Conditions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Directly Hired</th>
<th>Agency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hourly Wage</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AR</td>
<td>$6.00</td>
<td>$6.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FL and NJ</td>
<td>$10.00</td>
<td>$9.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Receives Fringe Benefits</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 to 5%</td>
<td>17 to 24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Very Satisfied with Wages and Benefits</strong></td>
<td>41 to 50%</td>
<td>19 to 23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Very Satisfied Overall</strong></td>
<td>79 to 85%</td>
<td>69 to 83%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Training and Preparedness of Directly Hired Workers

- Half trained in personal care or routine health care

On the other hand—

- Felt well-informed about care recipient’s condition (~90%)
- Felt fully prepared for job (>90%)
- Injuries and physical strain similar to agency workers providing equal hours of care
Worker Well-Being

- Directly Hired Workers More Likely to:
  - Experience emotional strain
  - Want more respect from consumer’s family
Worker Well-Being (cont’d)

Feels Emotional Strain

Wants More Respect

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percent</th>
<th>Related</th>
<th>Not Related</th>
<th>Agency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>43</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Conclusions

- More emotional involvement than professional detachment
  - Relationships with consumers were strong

- More hands-on experience than formal training
  - But training is a good idea

- More overall satisfaction than financial compensation
  - The work force is dependable